A ballot to all dues-paying members of IASTAM was mailed in July, and the results of the election were announced on October 4.

Professor Paul U. Unschuld, President of IASTAM, will officially turn over his office to the newly elected President, Francis Zimmermann, on January 7 in Bombay.

Carol Laderman has been elected Secretary-General, and the other officers, running unopposed, include Kenneth G. Zysk as Treasurer, and three Vice-Presidents,

Professor Ma Kenwen (Beijing),
Hakim Mohammed Said (Islamabad),
Professor K. M. Udupa (Varanasi).

continued in page Three

IMPORTANT BOOKS REVIEWED

Lila Abu-Lughod Veiled Sentiments  Pp. 2
François Jullien Process of Creation  4-5
Harvey Alper Understanding Mantras  6-7
Emiko Ohnuki-Tierney Monkey as Mirror  8-9
McKim Marriot Ethnosociology of India  10-11
Nicole Revel Rice in South-East Asia  12-13
Andrew Learmonth Disease Ecology  14-15

THE ASIAN MEDICINE NEWSLETTER is published twice a year to be circulated free of charge to the paid members of IASTAM. It carries book reviews, research notes, news of people and of recent or forthcoming events. It will be continued in its present format, as complementary to the announced Journal of Asian Medicine.

continued in page Three

editorial

continuity

In composing each and every issue of the newsletter, we are trying to establish, through the process of reviews, a scientific domain of our own, a new focus of research, shaped and marked out by the most significant publications. All topical questions touched in previous issues will be addressed again. For example, we noted in the previous issue that the new themes of Emotion and Affect are being incorporated into medical anthropology, and a paper by M.J. Fischer (IASTAM News. 12, p. 7) brought to

continued in page Three
Margaret Trawick and Lila Abu-Lughod are studying the very same basic tenets of femininity in traditional ideology: passion and anger, sexuality, lust, vulnerability, and emotion, but in an ethnographic context, that is, in a context of performance (songs and oral poetry), where these ideas are not, or not yet, medicalized. They both belong to a new brand of anthropologists who do not write monographs any more, but narratives and personal accounts of a very rare and delicate encounter. Their own femininity, and the literary quality of their writings, help them to set up a new style, a new standard, and a new paradigm. They went inside, and they studied the inner world at large. Think, in particular, of the linguistic skills and years of practice required from an American to catch, translate and convey to us the hundred nuances of irony, love and sorrow in Tamil. Margaret Trawick's book will be reviewed in one of our next issues; but we wanted to announce it, and compare Trawick's work to Abu-Lughod's. In Tamilnad (South India), women agricultural laborers belonging to untouchable castes sing many songs giving voice to their complex feelings concerning the nature of human relations. Let me give you the flavor of Trawick's evocation ("Spirtis and voices," p. 196): "The Paraiyar laborers' songs of themselves, like my dreams of my days with them, were brimming with vegetative imagery: they called themselves eggplants, lentils, onions, grains, flowers on the vine. They blossomed, they fruitied, they ripened, they were plucked and eaten, they were dried in the sun, they were left for seed. In their songs, they did not own the earth around them, they were that earth. The Paraiyar laborers were people of the open and unfinished body..."

Bedouins who live in the Western Desert of Egypt, more precisely Bedouin women and young men, also sing many songs, to express personal feelings that violate their moral code. These ghinnawas, or "little songs," are "lyric poems, like Japanese haiku in form but more like the American blues in content and emotional tone" (p. 27). They have provided Lila Abu-Lughod with the thematique, the set of themes, of her person-centered ethnographic account. We do not pretend here to review this book in all its richness; we must select one or two themes that are more relevant to the perspectives of this Newsletter, that is, from the standpoint of an anthropology of illness and healing.

Through the analysis of oral poetry, Lila Abu-Lughod has reached an original concept of illness: "Illness, in folk psychology a consequence of any negative emotions" (p. 202). However, the presence of fear at the core of all diseases is somewhat blurred, when the anthropologist, falling victim of her academic training, superimposes on it a grid continued in page sixteen
editorial
continued from page one

our attention Lila Abu-Lughod's Veiled Sentiments. To
enhance the informative value and suggestive power of
our comments, we are now reviewing this book in con-
junction with consonant essays that deal with different
cultures. This method of combined reviews on a given
common theme — here, Femininity — aims to emphasize the
comparative aspects of Asian medicine. Margaret Trawick's
papers and forthcoming book on Love in a Tamil Family of
South India complement Lila Abu-Lughod's essay on Bedouin
women of Egypt. Both anthropologists elaborate the cul-
tural poetics of emotion, while Charlotte Furth's papers
on the female condition in Chinese history is enriching our
knowledge of the traditional body image. I would
like to suggest that a plus is gained through this com-
parison. Although they have come from such distant places
as Egypt, India and China, Lila Abu-Lughod, Margaret
Trawick and Charlotte Furth are addressing the same
issues. They have a lot to say to each other, and it is
the goal of IASTAM Newsletter to further this encounter.

crossing boundaries

We confess taking a malicious pleasure in crossing boundaries between cultures and specialized domains.
Although our logotype juxtaposes Sanskrit, Chinese, and
Arabic characters (symbolizing the three classical tra-
ditions of Asia), Asian medicine to us is not the mere
juxtaposition of various areas, languages and disci-
plines. Our method is to systematically cross all
perspectives, so that news and reviews may interest all
readers, beyond the restricted circle of classical phil-
ologists. Versatility is the richness of IASTAM. The
uniqueness of IASTAM resides in the exceptionally wide
range of cultures and disciplines represented in its
membership, a whole world of medical studies and prac-
tices, from the Arabic and Persian in the west to the
Korean and Japanese in the far east, from textual studies
to popular beliefs, from ecology and ethnobiology to
philosophy and ethics, and from the ancient sciences of
long life to contemporary health care systems. Our scope
also extends beyond the boundaries of academic scholar-
ship, since we should not underestimate the geopolitical
and economic impact of Asian medicine on today's inter-
national relations and public health policies. This is
enough to justify our efforts to establish Asian medi-
cine as a new focus of attention.

Francis Zimmermann

International Association for the
Study of Traditional Asian Medicine

FRANCIS ZIMMERMANN, the new President of IASTAM, is
a Directeur de recherche (tenured research professor)
at the French National Centre for Scientific Research
(CNRS) in Paris. Office address: Centre d'etudes de
l'Inde et de l'Asie du Sud, Ecole des Hautes Etudes en
Sciences Sociales, 54 Boulevard Raspail, 75006
Paris, France. Trained in anthropology, Sanskrit
and philosophy of science, he is a recipient of
the Wellcome Medal for Research in Anthropology
as Applied to Medical Problems, awarded to him
by the Royal Anthropological Institute in 1986.
His publications include: The Jungle and the Aroma
of Meats, An Ecological Theme in Hindu Medicine,
Berkeley, University of California Press, 1987;
and Le Discours des Remèdes au Pays des Épices
(Remedies and Medical Discourse in the Land of
Spices), Paris, Payot Publ., 1989, English version
forthcoming from the University of California
Press. The latter book is an anthropological account
of the Astavaidya tradition of Ayurvedic medicine
in Kerala (South India).

CAROL LADERMAN, the new Secretary-General, is a
Professor in the Department of Sociology and Anthro-
pology at Fordham University, Bronx, New York 10458,
USA. She was a recipient of the John Simon Guggen-
heim Fellowship in 1987. Her publications include:
Wives and Midwives, Children and Nutrition in Rural
Malaysia, Berkeley, University of California Press,
1983; now available in paperback; several papers
on Humoralism (see IASTAM Newsl. 11, p. 9); and a
new book on Malay shamanism, forthcoming from
Berkeley (University of California Press).

KENNETH G. ZYSK, the new Treasurer, teaches at
Eastern Michigan University, Department of History
and Philosophy, Ypsilanti, MI 48197, USA. He was
a Founder of IASTAM with his teacher A.L. Basham
in Canberra in 1979 (see the moving obituary he
published in IASTAM Newsl. 8, pp. 3-4). His publica-
tions include: Religious Healing in the Veda,
Philadelphia, American Philosophical Society, 1985
(see IASTAM Newsl. 9, pp. 4 & 6); Asceticism and
Healing in Ancient India, Medicine in the Buddhist

Bombay 1990

FORTHCOMING IN THE NEXT ISSUE

a review of the most significant scientific
contributions to our Congress, the THIRD
INTERNATIONAL CONGRESS ON TRADITIONAL ASIAN
MEDICINE (4th to 7th January 1990, Bombay)
The announced panels or symposia (with their or-
organizer's name) include: Indian and Chinese medi-
ical history (Paul Unschuld), Islamic medicine in
Asia (Anne Sweetser), Chinese healing traditions
(Thomas Ots), Religion and curing (Cromwell
Crawford), Ritual therapies in the Himalayas
(Gregory Maskarinec), Cultural beliefs and mental
health (Mitchell Weiss), Guru and psychotherapist
(Jacques Vigne), The performance of healing (Carol
Laderman, Marina Roseman), Martial arts and medi-
continued in page sixteen
Francois Jullien on China
Francois JULLIEN
Process ou Création.
Une introduction à la pensée des lettrés chinois,
[Process or Creation. An Introduction to the Modes of Thought of Chinese Scholars]
ISBN 2-02-010253-6  320 pp.  FF 170

This essay is based on a close reading and interpretation of the works of Wang Fuzhi or Wang Chuan-shan (1619–1692), a Chinese scholar in the line of Neo–Confucianism, whose writings represent the ultimate exemplification of Chinese thought before it comes into contact with Western thought. This essay itself is a scholarly piece of work, although it is meant not for the exclusive use of the "specialist," but for a large audience of well-read people. Appended to the book are three "Repères" [i.e., coordinates], a nice French word to designate the critical apparatus: biographies of Chinese scholars mentioned in the text, a highly specialized bibliography (including Chinese, Japanese, and English studies on Wang Fuzhi [English authors say Wang Fu-chih]), and a listing of all Chinese phrases cited or glossed in the essay, that are reproduced both in transliteration and in Chinese characters. This book is anything but dull or pedestrian. Although it is written in a very polished and elegant style, it might be difficult to read for a foreigner, and one might question François Jullien's predilection for fashionable metaphors. For example, he borrows from Gilles Deleuze and the Parisian idiom the word pli (fold, pleat) to designate the specific modes of thought, the unconscious framing of thought in a given culture. Chinese scholars have accustomed to think of action in terms of "process," whereas Western philosophers have accustomed to conceive of it in terms of "creation." François Jullien points to the concepts of process, pervasion, correlation, etc., as revealing a specific habitus of Chinese thought, un pli particulier, a particular structure inscribed in the culture text like a pleat inscribed in a fabric, or else, like a fold inscribed in the bedrock of Chinese thought. This is the kind of metaphors of which the main purpose is to mark out the author for recognition on the Parisian intellectual scene. A non-initiate might pause also, when faced with phrases like: "esquisser une problématique à dimension interculturelle – par effet de différence" (p. 17). In clear, Jullien's objective is "to outline the problematics of cross-cultural comparison by bringing out contrasts." Contrasts like Process vs. Creation are deliberately exaggerated in order to reveal the tenets of Chinese thought, more exactly, its specific habitus.

Jullien's point of departure (see his book, p. 42 and 84) is to be found in the reading of Jacques Gernet, Chine et Christianisme: Action et Réaction, Paris: Gallimard, 1982 (An English translation is available in print). The idea of Creation, which appeared as an unquestionable evidence to the Jesuit missionaries who had turned up at Peking in the eighteenth century, collided with a totally different idea, the idea of Process which itself appeared as an unquestioned evidence to Chinese scholars. Therefore, there could not be any encounter or debate between China and Christianity, but only defence reaction and rejection. "Incompatibility was rooted in the very structure of the modes of thought," Jullien says, since there are various, incompatible modes of rationality, and philosophy, as a specifically Western tradition, recognizes only one of them: "Or la philosophie ne dialogue toujours qu'à l'intérieur d'une même rationalité. Il est légitime qu'elle passe alors la main à l'anthropologie." Philosophy is ethnocentric, Western philosophers enter into dialogues within only one and the same mode of rationality. Therefore, their handing over the problematics of rationality to anthropologists is right in order (Jullien, p. 84).

One of the most innovative aspects of Jullien's book is the wealth of references to Western classical philosophers: Leibniz (pp. 17, 91, 156, 275, 285), Kant (136, 285), Hegel (231, 271), etc.; and closer to traditional thought, Plato's Timaeus (83, 179), the Stoics (150, 219-230), Thomas Aquinas (89, 167). However, it does not strike a fair balance between the Chinese side of the comparison, focusing on the intricacies of Wang Fuzhi's thought, and the Western side, where it remains at the surface of things. Kant's famous exclamation, for example, which is quoted out of context (in p. 136): "The starry sky above me, and the moral principle in me," might weaken Jullien's argument in the mind of some readers. This is the kind of formulas that are committed to memory by freshmen in the French colleges. The same is true with the Stoic motto quoted in p. 221: one should live "in conformity with nature." The German "sky" and the Greek "nature" are highly elaborate conceptions; allusions to these conceptions through a limited stock of text-book quotations are likely to remain unconvincing. Nevertheless, Jullien's book is a challenge and a breakthrough in the field of comparative philosophy. One should appreciate the finely-worded and insightful approach to Chinese concepts like that of li, reason, inherent logic, a principle of coherence inherent in reality (pp. 127, 148, 165, etc.). "Chinese thought is to be not 'explained' but 'elucidated'." According to the traditional etymology (which is questioned today, but still of symbolic value), the Chinese word we render as 'reason' (the li) originally denoted the art of 'carving from jade' (Beméville said 'the working out of uncut jade by taking advantage of its structural veins'). Let us patiently
follow these veins, through ramifications and cleavages, down to the deepest luminosity of the seam" (p. 23).

Jullien shows (p. 180) that conceptualization in Chinese is obtained through correlations, through the double play on opposition and association of two terms in a binomial, like Tian-dao, "the Sky (tian) and the Path (dao)." or Shen-hua, "the Spirit dimension (shen) and the Concrete transformation (hua)." This "principle of conceptualization through correlation" (p. 181) is applied in the semantical and syntactical parallelisms of Chinese poetry and special types of prose based on binomials, similes and symmetries. A concept is a node in a network of intersecting polarities. "Even the notion of 'Sky' (tian), a term unique par excellence and the keystone of Chinese scholarly thought, cannot stand as a concept by itself alone; it hardly is a concept, it is rather an indefinite virtuality of meaning... and it actually becomes an operating concept only when opposed to one of its correlates. For example: 'Sky' correlated with... 'Path' (dao) to mean the steady cycle of the seasons and the endless engendering of existent beings, 'Sky' correlated with 'Inherent order' (li) to mean the principle of coherence in things and their intrinsic nature, 'Sky' correlated with 'Breath' (material energy, qi [chi]) to mean the atmospheric sky, the material reality of the world in its non-concrete early stage of latency and emptiness, etc." (p. 179).

Of special interest to the readers of IASTAM Newsletter will be the definition and glosses of qi as "elementary breaths" (pp. 141, 150), "material energy" (pp. 146, 148, 151, 168 [c'], 178-9, 223, 260, etc.), and Jullien's reflections (pp. 150-1) on the difficulty of conveying to the Western reader the internal play on the correlative meanings of qi in Chinese: "Everything is 'matter' (as 'material energy', qi), even the Spirit dimension (shen), which nevertheless is its counterpart and may categorically be its opposite (qi and shen then forming a pair)... A semantic effect can be created within the notion of qi which integrates spirit into matter. Also important to us will be the recurring theme of a complementarity between landscape and emotion, in the Chinese scholar's view of his lived world. Chapter One is rightfully entitled The Salience of Nature (L'Evidence de la Nature), and the first words of this chapter are telling: "In the beginning was alternation: inhaling and exhaling, day and night, the heat of summer and the cold of winter..." (p. 27). Jullien opens his book with a philosophical analysis of the cycle of the seasons, and he closes it (pp. 246-9) on an analysis of the symbiosis of landscape and emotion in Chinese poetry, a symbiosis being a process, an encounter, a "mutual incitation" between interiority and exteriority, that is, an opposite to the Western concept of poetry as creation. According to Wang Fuzhi, there is an essential correspondence between the stream of consciousness and the evolution of nature, which can be conceptualized in the form of a binomial, Jing-qing, "Landscape" (jing [ch'ing] and "Emotion" (qing [ching]). The landscape is brought to life by the poet's emotion, and the poet can experience and apprehend the most subtle feelings of consciousness only through the "mood" of an evoked landscape. Wang Fuzhi derides the poor school-teacher who conscientiously explains a regular Chinese poem in dividing the distich on landscape from the distich on emotion (p. 247). Actually, "Landscape and emotion are not originally separable, and the emphasis on the one or the other of these two poles merely depends on the orientation of our attention" (Wang Fuzhi, Remarks on Poetry, quoted in p. 248).

François Jullien gives us in this excellent book a rich, brilliant and provocative introduction to the comparative epistemology of Chinese modes of thought.
Harvey Alper

Harvey P. Alper, Editor
Understanding Mantras,
also available

CONTENTS

Harvey P. Alper, "Introduction" (pp. 1-14) [Outlines the major controversies in Western scholarship concerning the nature of mantras and gives a paradigm for resolving the issues]
Ellison Banks Finly, "Mantra kaviśāāta: Speech as performative in the Brāhmaṇa (pp. 1-47)"
Frits Staal, "Vedic Mantras" (pp. 48-95)
Wade T. Wheelock, "The Mantra in Vedic and Tantric ritual" (pp. 96-122)
Kenneth G. Zysk, "Mantra in Ayurveda: A study of the use of magico-religious speech in ancient Indian medicine" (pp. 123-143)
John Taber, "Are Mantras speech acts? The Bhāratīya point of view" (pp. 144-164)
Harold Coward, "The meaning and power of Mantras in Bhartṛhari’s Vākyapadīya" (pp. 165-176)
Ludo Rocher, "Mantras in the Śīvapurāṇa" (pp. 177-203)
Gerhard Oberhammer, "The use of Mantra in Yogic meditation: The testimony of the Pāṇḍūpata" (pp. 204-223)
Sanjukta Gupta, "The Pāṇḍūpata attitude to Mantra" (pp. 224-248)
Harvey P. Alper, "The cosmos of Śiva’s language-game: ‘Mantra’ according to Kṣemarāja’s Śivasūtras-vimāraśīni" (pp. 249-294)
André Padoux, "Conclusion: Mantras – What are they?" (pp. 295-318)
Harvey P. Alper, "A working bibliography for the study of Mantras" (pp. 327-443)
Bibliographic list (pp. 444-530)

This book is much more than a monograph on a specialized topic; actually, it strikes at the heart of Hindu culture. What is at stake is the religious authority and magical efficacy of Speech. Philosophers and sanskritists will discover in these 530 dense pages an incredible wealth of erudite materials, and much more than mere erudition. Not only is this book a reference book covering nearly all sectors of Indian philosophy, but the conceptual grid is so finely worked that it offers a perfect and comprehensive initiation to Indian thought. It was edited carefully, in an elegant format. It is a pity that Professor Harvey P. Alper (1945-1987), who died suddenly in April 1987 after completing the editorial work, could not be still with us to see this excellent volume in print.

Of immeasurable worth is the "Working bibliography," contributed by Harvey Alper. Synthetic and critical notices covering more than 1600 items bring to the student’s attention the classics in the field as well as out-of-the-way publications. The grid consists of the following subdivisions, which are listed here in full to testify to the thematic richness of the whole volume.

The Vedic world: the worldview and practice of the Veda (the understanding of speech and speaking in the Veda; poems and poetic inspiration; the social and ritual context of Vedic mantraśāstra); Vedic texts (Ṛgveda; Sāmaveda; other Śaṃhitās and Brāhmaṇas); mantras in the Brahmancial tradition (commentaries on the Veda; the Śūtra literature; mantras in daily life; mantras and renunciation; the ‘act of truth’; the survival of exemplary mantras in the Hindu period).

Post-Vedic traditions other than Tantric: reading, writing, and speaking in traditional India; religious traditions (Hinduism; the significance of names; Hindu theism and the great Sampradāyas); the philosophical and scientific traditions (Vaiśeṣika and philosophical language; Pūrvamīmāṃsā; other philosophical traditions; Ayurveda and other traditions of Indian science).

Tantra: ideology of tantra (deities: Āktaka and Śekta); Tantra and Advaita; the social and ritual context of mantraśāstra (the spatial setting of mantras; the ‘magical’ context; the Guru as Master of mantraśāstra; mantra as enigma); Tantric texts dealing with mantra (Agamas; classical Tantras; manuals); mantraśāstra and sūdhanā (initiation and other preparatory rites; mantra and meditation); the world of sound (Vāc and her permutations; the Tantric ‘alphabet’; bijas and other exemplary mantras).

The diffusion of mantras: Indo-European background; non-Hindu and quasi-Hindu mantric traditions within India (the use of mantras among ‘tribal groups’; among Muslims, Sikhs, Jains; in Indian Buddhism); mantras beyond India; mantras in neo-Hinduism.


Mantras (Sanskrit, "instruments of thought") are short formulae, or even mere monosyllabic invocations (like "om"), used in rituals along with other spiritual tools like diagrams or yantras ("instruments of restraint") to achieve some goal. Says Alper: "As a tool of human intentionality, mantras are protan. They are used in an astonishing variety of contexts, for a plethora of purposes, with a multitude of informing emotions... The [Hindu] tradition..."
takes for granted that mantras are anything but arbitrary and interchangeable. Each of them is understood to be a finely honed instrument for exercising power, a tool designed for a particular task, which will achieve a particular end when, and only when, it is used in a particular manner. ... It is possible to get a handle on the sorts of situations in which mantras characteristically are used" (pp. 6-7). Alper suggests a simple foursided grid for comparing mantras.

**LINGUISTICALITY**

- domestic mantras
- Veda
- sacrificial mantras
  - "ôm"
  - (pujā)
- devotional mantras
  - (japa)
- Tantra
- meditative mantras
  - (japa)
  - (bīja-s)

**QUOTIDIAN INTENTION**

**REDEPTIVE INTENTION**

Alper's grid summarizes and combines in a very illuminating manner the two most fundamental discussions about mantras, which concern (1) their efficacy, and (2) their meaning.

The horizontal scale shows intentionality. Towards the left pole mantras are placed that are uttered predominantly to achieve some specific practical goal, e.g., the discovery of lost cattle, the cure of impotence or barrenness. Towards the right pole, mantras are placed that are uttered predominantly to achieve some transcendental goal, e.g., liberation from samsāra, the mitigation of bad karma, the devotee's transportation to the realm of one's desired god. The scale is understood as a continuum, from the multitudinous dilemmas of daily life (on the left) to the desire of redeeming the human condition as a whole. The issue of efficacy is addressed in terms of intentionality, and Alper has deliberately "attempted to avoid invoking the hackneyed Western distinction between magic and religion" (p. 8 footnote).

Let us elaborate on this particular issue from the angle of medical efficacy. There is no different nature of two mantras, one of which is used in the preparation of drugs or the cure of bodily ills, and the other one in the treatment of mental illnesses along with meditation and Yoga. (See Padoux's remarks in p. 314 of the book under review.) The first of these two mantras, which is used to achieve a kind of "magical efficacy," seems to be more impersonal and mechanical than the latter, which is used (in combination with meditation, worship, etc.) to achieve a kind of "catharsis" of the whole person. However, they both should be placed on the same continuum, i.e., the horizontal scale on Alper's grid, the first one closer to the daily life pole, and the latter closer to the redemptive intention pole. Even the most mechanical use of mantras involves a multitude of informing emotions. This is the reason why mantras are ambiguous, or polyvalent, instruments, at the interface of linguistics (speech acts), psychiatry (emotional states), magic (achieving goals of daily life), and religion (redemptive intentions).

The vertical scale on Alper's grid shows linguistics. Towards the top he places mantras that are entirely intelligible as sentences in an ordinary language, e.g., the Gāyatrī. Towards the bottom pole he places bīja mantras ("phonie" germs"), meaningless syllables which tend to prove that mantra is not a language. This is a vexed question both in the traditional exegesis (see Taber's excellent essay on Mīmāṃsā) and in the contemporary debates (see Staal's paradoxical views, and Alper's or Padoux's responses). Alper's vertical scale should also be understood as a continuum. There is no strong divide between semantics and pragmatics in the traditional Indian views on language. From top to bottom, on Alper's grid, there is a shift of emphasis, and we move progressively from mantras of a more semantic nature to mantras of a more pragmatic nature. But pragmatics is part of linguistics.

We hope to have said enough of this remarkable book to show that it may interest a large audience outside the circle of Indian studies.

---

**Frits Staal**

**Frits STAAL**

**Universals, Studies in Indian Logic and Linguistics,** Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1988


This book is a collection of articles and review essays published in various journals between 1960 and 1977 by Professor J. F. Staal, the distinguished philosopher and indologist, who teaches at the University of California, Berkeley. It includes nearly all of Staal's papers on Indian logic and Indian linguistics. All the students of these two disciplines who have striven for years to secure photocopies will now be able to have a personal copy.
This book examines the historical transformations of the concept of self and other in Japan, in studying the monkey as metaphor for humans. The historical and ethnographic data collected by Professor Ohnuki-Tierney illustrate and document the training of Japanese macaques for monkey performances (as a street performing art and, formerly, as a ritual) and the social position of the monkey trainers, who belong to the burakumin, the 'special status' people. The author, herself a native of Japan and Vilas Professor of Anthropology at the University of Wisconsin (Madison), traces changes in Japanese culture from the eighth century to the present. During early periods of Japanese history the monkey's nearness to the human-animal boundary made it a revered mediator or an animal deity closest to humans. Later it became a scapegoat mocked for its vain efforts to behave in a human fashion. Modern Japanese have begun to see a new meaning in the monkey—a clown who turns itself into an object of laughter while challenging the basic assumptions of Japanese culture and society.

In 1980, while she conducted fieldwork on illness perception and health care, the author had the opportunity to observe the then recently revived monkey performances in Hakiri City, Yamaguchi Prefecture in western Japan, in the midst of a festival held at a shrine for Ebisu, a guardian deity of fishermen who is closely associated with the monkey. There is little information about monkey performances elsewhere in the country, but we did have some information about trainers and their activities in the Yamaguchi Prefecture since the middle of the Meiji period (1868–1912). Trainers all originated from the settlements of special status people located in that particular region (pp. 119–133). They used to journey all over Japan to perform, and return to these settlements when they completed the journey. The development in the 1920s of the burakumin liberation movement led to the discontinuance of monkey performance, because many 'special status' people wished to eradicate any trace of their identity. Since the 1920s, the monkey performance was virtually absent until 1977–1978, when a group of young burakumin revived it. "Unlike other burakumin, who believed that the eradication of all traces of their past was essential in achieving equality and removing prejudice, these people felt that knowledge of their past was essential in asserting their own identity in Japanese society" (p. 123). However, Emiko Ohnuki-Tierney had predicted the eventual disappearance of this traditional form of street entertainment (pp. 124, 186). Luckily, she was wrong and, when she returned to visit in 1984, she found the monkey performance thriving in the post-industrial setting. The ethnographic description concentrates on performances at Yoyogi Park in Tokyo, observed in 1984.

The recent developments of this tradition make fascinating reading, because they illustrate a philosophical debate on the human-animal boundary. The original group of monkey trainers observed in 1980, consisting of two brothers and their families, split into two groups shortly after Ohnuki-Tierney's visit. "The division of the original group was due to a philosophical difference about the nature of the relationship between humans and monkeys" (p. 124). Both groups have named the monkeys with the first names of humans. "For example, the trainer Taro's monkey was named Jiro. Taro is a common first name for the oldest son in a family, and Jiro is a common name for the second oldest son in the family. Thus, this trainer and his monkey were 'posing' as brothers. The trainers talked and interacted with the monkeys as if they were their own children" (p. 123); a telling picture is Photo 11 (p. 203), which shows monkey Jiro in his house, especially built for him (with a carpet, a TV set, etc.). However, the trainers repeatedly emphasized the ferocity of the "beast" which could instantly rip off one's nose, ears, or fingers. The ambiguous mixing of humanity with fierceness allows for two different attitudes. One of the two brothers who revived the art maintained that humans and monkeys must be in a harmonious and egalitarian relationship with each other. He and his school have tried to remain faithful to the tradition. The trainers sing songs that were sung during monkey performances in the past, and they engage in only a limited amount of improvisation and narration. The monkeys dance to music, clothed in the traditional attire of the kimono and the hakama. This school stresses the ideas of mediation and continuity. The other brother and his group, however, believe that the trainers must establish dominance over monkeys, and maintain a pecking order. They have adapted the monkey performance to contemporary popular culture and turned the monkey into a regular clown. The original idea of the monkey performance as a ritual and blessing is lost, when the monkey becomes a trickster and a clown, but clowning is a new way of mirroring the onlooker's self.

Ethnography gives the book its topicality, but history gives it intellectual breadth. Emiko Ohnuki-Tierney learnt from her teacher, Jan Vansina, the value of diachrony, and how to study cultures through time. Accordingly, she reconstructs the history of monkey performance, from a time when it was a ritual, a performance held especially in horse stables as part of healing rituals. Structures and categories of collective thought play an important role in Ohnuki-Tierney's anthropology, but they are flexible enough to espouse various historical contexts. "We might think of a culture as an entity.
that tightens or relaxes its grids or categorical principles," she writes (p. 228), and the profound qualitative changes that are thus involved will occur through history.

Ohnuki-Tierney traces the dualism of Japanese cosmology back to the yin-yang principle which was introduced to Japan from China. More exactly, she speculates that a similar dualism had already characterized Japanese cosmology "before" (p. 130) the introduction of the yin-yang. She admits that defining the cosmology of the Japanese throughout history in terms of the yin-yang principle alone may seem to be a sweeping generalization. Buddhist principles should also be taken into account, especially the idea of hierarchy (implied in the concepts of karma and transmigration) which contradicts the dialectic of yin and yang. However, the author argues that yin-yang and Taoistic principles have impregnated the symbolic world of today's urban, educated Japanese (p. 133).

In that respect, the present book is complementary to an earlier one on illness and health care. The successful revival of monkey performances as a street entertainment is better understood when compared with the profusion of "urban magic" (p. 133) in a deceptively "modernized" and industrialized contemporary Japan. Details of these forms of urban magic wrapped in commercialism were presented in E. Ohnuki-Tierney, Illness and Culture in Contemporary Japan, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1984 (spec. pp. 143-144). One might say that clowning monkeys have become part of this magic.

The argument which underlies the image of monkey as mirror is that of "the centrality of ambiguity in a dualistic universe," a recurring phrase throughout the book (pp. 153, 156, 158, 213, 239, etc.). In the Japanese cosmology and Japanese society (where the burakumin are conceived of as marginals), "the dualism of the self and other is not a static one" (p. 136). Monkeys occupy a peripheral position in the category of animals (and animal deities). Therefore, they represent the negative side of humans both as a metaphor and as a metonym (p. 220). As a metaphor, since they look like stupid humans, and as a metonym because they embody the negative side of humans, they in a sense belong to humanity. The same ambivalence affects all relationships between deities and humans, between the sphere of hare (the sacred) and the sphere of ke (the secular). "Hare and ke do not stand squarely as sacred vs. secular, or pure vs. impure. They mirror each other, they constitute "a reflexive structure," they share each other's dual qualities. For example, "the secular too is being kept pure through rituals... the contemporary Japanese strive to keep their body and house - the spatial representation of the self - clean... hygienic practices are secular rites of purification" (pp. 142-143). Monkeys' ambivalence takes the form of a violent/peaceful character, a mediator/marginal role. Ohnuki-Tierney proposes to interpret this fundamental ambivalence on the model of ancient deities called marebito. The marebito was a god in ancient Japan who periodically visited the villages from the world located on the other side of the sea (p. 129). "The marebito, or stranger/outsider deities who come from outside a settlement or outside Japan, constitute the semiotic other for the Japanese, which is symbolically equivalent to their transcendent self; that is, they represent objectification of the Japanese themselves as a semiotic sign..." (p. 133). The monkey is such a semiotic other for the spectators in its contemporary performances as a full-blown clown. It is "the target of laughter, both from the trainer and the spectators, while it, on the other hand, mocks the spectators as humans and as Japanese and urges them to contemplate their self" (p. 204). Watching the monkey performance at the park in Tokyo in 1984, Emiko Ohnuki-Tierney suddenly realized that "the monkey was the embodiment of the transformational process itself - both historical and cultural," through which in all times the Japanese have strived to reach for the moon, a quest which is not a matter of pragmatic achievements, but a quest for their transcendent self (p. 240). A question of pride, of identity, and also, she concludes, an aesthetic experience. This is a brilliant and insightful book.

Alan Roland

Alan Roland
In Search of Self
in India and Japan,
Towards a Cross-Cultural Psychology
Princeton: University Press, 1988
386 pp. ISBN 0-691-06817-6

An American psychoanalyst explores the inner worlds of Indian and Japanese patients. A series of case studies illustrates his argument: the "familial self," rooted in the subtle emotional hierarchical relationships of the family and group, predominates in Indian and Japanese psyches and contrasts strongly with the Western "individualized self."

"The Introduction defines the familial, the individualized, and the spiritual self."

PART ONE, "The Indian and Japanese Self and Social Change," treats of: Indian identity and colonialism; Psychoanalysis in India and Japan; The familial self, individualization, and the modernization process; The dynamics of change in urban Indian and Japanese women; The Indian self, reflections in the mirror of the American life style.

continued in page fifteen
McKim Marriott

Ethnosociology

Edited by McKim MARRIOTT

Toward an Ethnosociology of India
A Special Issue of
Contributions to Indian Sociology,
New Series, Volume 23, Number 1,
January-June 1989


Contents:

McKim MARRIOTT, "Constructing an Indian Ethnosociology" (pp. 1-39)

A. K. RAMANUJAN, "Is there an Indian way of thinking? An informal essay" (47-58)

Nicholas B. DIRKS, "The original caste: power, history and hierarchy in South Asia" (59-78)

Gloria Goodwin RAREJA, "Centrality, mutuality and hierarchy: shifting aspects of inter-caste relationships in North India!" (79-102)

Diana Paul MINES, "Hindu periods of death 'impurity'" (103-130)

Susan S. WADLEY and Bruce W. DERR, "Eating sins in Karimpur" (131-140)

Manuel MORENO and McKim MARRIOTT, "Humoral transactions in two Tamil casts: Murukan and Marimman" (149-167)

Melinda A. MOORE, "The Kerala house as a Hindu cosmos" (169-202)

McKim Marriott's Ethnosociology of India represents one of the most innovative and inspiring endeavors at the confluence of anthropology and comparative epistemology. For sure, every "specialist," feeling responsible for the maintenance of orthodoxy in his or her special domain, will be tempted to respond to Kim Marriott's constructions by tearing them to pieces. Nevertheless, the details of his analyses might need revision and further elaboration, but the inspiration will stand out. Let us say first a few words of this collection of essays as a whole, and then focus on Kim Marriott's contribution. If ethnoscience can be defined as a collective attempt at breaking with "the imperial style of Western" social anthropology (p. 4) and creating a paradigm shift, the team here includes four different types of contributors: (1) Ramanujan should be set aside; as the title of his essay rightly says, he brings an "informal" support to the enterprise; he represents a major influence on the Western intellectual scene, whose work is consonant with Marriott's. (2) Dirks, Raheja and Wadley are authors who speak for themselves; their contributions in this volume should be compared with the brilliant books they have published elsewhere; [e.g. G. G. Raheja, The Poison in the Gift, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1988 will be reviewed in one of our next issues. (3) The essays by Mines, Moreno, and Moore have been written in close collaboration with Marriott; they represent as many illustrations of Marriott's approach to and use of the Hindu classical lists of categories. (4) Professor McKim Marriott himself is "carrying forward" (p. 33) a long-awaited project, in publishing an elaborate introduction to "Indian ethnoscience." All these four types of contributions are necessary, to make ethnoscience something different from an individual enterprise, a new orientation shared by a number of scholars, be they coming from inside the inner circle of Kim Marriott's students or from outside like A.K. Ramanujan. Furthermore, there is a fifth group of participants in the ethnoscience new wave, which should not be overlooked: a number of anthropologists like E. Valentine Daniel or Margaret Trawick have been deeply influenced by Kim Marriott's ideas and, reciprocally, their books will help to shape and amplify the new wave.

"Sociology," in ethnoscience, stands for the array of social sciences. An "ethno-" social science is one of the various social sciences developed from the standpoint of a particular non-Western culture. An "Indian" ethnoscience science, for example, develops from thought about "Indian cultural realities." "Attending to what is perceived by Indians in Indian categories," "re-cognition of Indian realities," "attention to Indian realities," and "non-European people's thoughts about their own realities": the repetition of the same motto is striking, in the very first page of Marriott's essay (p. 1). These realities (an object of study for anthropologists) are "cultural" realities, and they are "perceived" by the actors themselves in categories. Right from the beginning, Marriott's essay breaks with the dominant paradigm of sociology and anthropology. To him, there is no longer any validity in the worn-out concepts of meaning, signs, or semiotics and pragmatics. He is rejecting all Western keys of interpretation, listing all the so-called universals of sociology which embody Western prejudices: individual, social structure, kinship, class, status, . . ., hierarchy, authority, value, ideology, religion, purity, etc. "The investigator who seeks ways of asking in rural India about equivalents of Western 'individuals', 'social structures', 'kinship', . . ., etc., risks imposing an alien ontology and an alien epistemology on those who attempt to answer. Such terms of questioning are precipitates of Western social, intellectual, and particularly academic history" (p. 2). They are irrelevant, they are "overridden" (pp. 2, 3) by the Hindu notions. For example, "the 'means-end' and 'actor-action' dichotomies. . . which . . ."
summarize many of the above Western theoretical distinctions and concerns may seem like universal and unexceptionable notions, yet they are overridden by Hindu notions of karma, according to which ends inhere in means and actors are products of actions" (p. 3).

For all his criticisms addressed to scholars like Max Weber and Louis Dumont, whose work was strongly influenced by classical philosophy and history of science, McKim Marriott’s project is not so different from what had been called after Auguste Comte in Europe “comparative philosophy.” [Insightful notes on the origins of this school of thought and the figure of Masson-Oursel are found in: Wilhelm Halffman, India and Europe, Albany: SUNY Press, 1988, pp. 426-427.] The idea that a culture owns its specific “categories,” a concept of primary importance in Marriott’s essay, comes from Marcel Mauss, and Marriott’s attitude towards “realities” perceived by the actors themselves “in [their culture’s] categories” sounds much in accordance with the French tradition of historical anthropology launched two generations ago by Marcel Mauss and Marcel Granet and still flourishing among sinologists, h brilliantists, and medievalists. A logical consequence of this orientation is to bring together philology and social sciences, the textualist and the ethnographer. Not only should we tackle the vernacular discourses on Indian “categories,” that is, on a few Sanskrit words that crystallize the basic assumptions of Indian culture, but we must also cover the whole corpus of classic texts that have developed from the basic categories a set of full-fledged traditional sciences: medicine, physics (i.e., the Sāṃkhya), grammar, etc.

However, historians of science may want to request from McKim Marriott some clarification about the status ascribed to science in his essay. Traditional sciences like Ayurveda and Sāṃkhya are most instrumental to him, in so far as they are rooted in the Indian soil. After a suggestion made years ago by J.F. Staal (in a famous paper on “Euclid and Pāṇini”; see this issue of IASTAM Newsletter, p. 7; omitted in Marriott’s bibliography), he draws a contrast between Hindu grammar and Greek geometry, which he formulates as follows: “The perfect natural science for Hindu India has long been linguistics... the ideal natural science for the West has long been geometry...” (p. 6). Clearly, the word “natural” here is to be taken in a very unusual sense, to mean: a science rooted in the very essence of a given culture, a science rooted in what Marriott calls “the culture’s natural categories,” or “the culture’s ontology” (p. 4). These formulations are questionable. A mischievous critic would certainly argue that ‘science’ and the dichotomy of ‘natural’ sciences and ‘social’ sciences are precisely ranking among those Western theoretical distinctions and concerns denounced by Marriott himself, and overridden by Hindu notions. Unfortunately, this essay lacks reflection on ‘science’ as a constituted discipline, and the author’s use of phrases like “natural science,” “ethnoscience,” etc., is loose and uncritical. Sociology and ontology are both implicated in the Brahminic pursuit of dharmāstra, and Sanskrit śāstra connotes both the rationalistic pursuit of “science” like grammar or geometry and the ethical wisdom or religious authority of a “code.” In short, the acumen and impressive efforts here displayed in the analysis of the classical lists of categories in Sanskrit should also be brought to bear upon the figures of speech and all the literary genres in Sanskrit: dāśāṇa, śāstra, sūtra, etc., to explain from inside what is a ‘view’, a ‘science’, a ‘rule’, a ‘system’, a ‘category’, a ‘metonym’, etc.

A striking feature of Marriott’s ethnoscience is the elaborate use of three-dimensional graphing to interpret Indian lived worlds. Graphing gives intuitive visibility to the perspectivism of Hindu thought. Marriott’s point of departure lies in three fundamental characteristics of Sanskrit scientific texts (pp. 7–8): (1) All realities are listed, and there are various classical lists of categories. (2) None of these lists contains less than three items; triads are an ubiquitous form of listing, and they are systematically crisscrossed with each other. (3) All three (or more) terms of a fixed set are always present, always combined; “each element and humour is said to be more or less strongly present in every food or bodily tissue... each human aim more or less predominant in any person’s motivation”; the underlying logic is triadic, not dyadic, it is a logic of the more-or-less, not a logic of the all-or-nothing. This polythetic character of Hindu scientific discourse justifies Marriott’s presentations in the form of three-di- mensional property-spaces. One can predict that further research in Ayurveda (medicine), Nyāya (logic), and the history of science (including Hindu mathematics where this polythetic style of thought must be exposed) will substantiate Marriott’s intuitions.

Just a few words to conclude on his Ayurvedic materials. I would myself speak of “crisscrossing,” rather than “merging” the triads. Although I would agree [see also Aron Roșu, Les Conceptions Psychologiques dans les Textes Médicaux Indiens, Paris, 1978, p. 118] on an overall correspondence between tamas and ‘wind’, rajas and ‘bile’, and sattva and ‘plaque’, this correspondence is definitely not made explicit in Caraka, Sūtra 1, 37, Sūtra 4, 34-36, contrary to what Marriott says (p. 12): the two triads are, so to speak, articulated with each other. There are 3 bodily humors, the text says, and two mental humors (rajas and tamas). Period. The classic texts are not so easily tamed. What the student of Ayurveda can offer to help Kim Marriott in his compelling task is, with him, a dialogic reading.
Names of Rice
Nicole Revel continued from page twelve
an area which extends from China to the Lesser
Sunda islands, and from Madagascar to the Moluccas.
The Moluccas represent the Eastern limit of rice
cultivation. India and Burma, Korea and Japan have
remained out of the scope of this survey. This is a
reference work, highly specialized. It will be used by
linguists and archaeologists to reconstruct a
kind of proto-history of rice domestication, rice
cultivation, and diffusion. It will be used by ethno-
scientists, as a new, highly sophisticated tool, in
comparing the two basic ecosystems of rice, swiddens
and paddies. Maybe the presence or absence, the
relevancy or obsolescence of words designating, in
the various vernaculars, "seedlings," "paddy," "husked rice," "cooked rice," "porridge," "glutinous rice,
"or "munglusive rice," can be used as indicators to reconstruct, through comparison, the
traditional ecosystems and techniques of rice
cultivation, and to confirm or falsify two competing
hypotheses. The more common hypothesis is evolution-
ist: swiddens are older than paddies, and the geo-
grapher (e.g., Pierre Gourou, Riz et Civilisation,
Paris: Fayard Publ., 1984, pp. 59 ss. "De l'essart à
la rizière") observes an evolution of techniques,
from slash-and-burn and dry cultivation in the
highlands to the more recent cultivation of wet
varieties in paddies, and rice terraces. But, A. G.
Haudricourt and Georges Condominas have argued that
the story was not so simple, that rice might have been "adapted" to dry, shifting cultivation (see
G. Condominas, "De la rizière au mil"
ss.). This atlas, an ambitious project launched years
ago by G. Condominas and then handed over to Nicole
Revel, constitutes one step forward in the develop-
ment of comparative (i.e., both diachronic and syn-
chronic) lexicology.

Nicole Revel, Directeur de recherche au CNRS,
Paris, is an anthropologist and a well-known expert
on the Philippines. She has a new book in the press,
the result of many years of research into the Natural
History of the island of Palawan, Fleurs de Parole,
which will be reviewed in one of the next issues of
IASTAM Newsletter.

Professor G.D. Singhal, a distinguished professor
of surgery at the Institute of Medical Sciences,
Banaras Hindu University, is already known to all
students of Ayurveda as the General Editor of the
Sushruta-samhita (Text and English translation) in
twelve volumes [Available with Singhal Publications,
C/o Dr. G.D. Singhal, 17 Medical Enclave, B.H.U.,
Varanasi 221005, India.] The text and English trans-
lation of the Madhava-nidana are published in the
same format.

This is a most welcome addition to the library of
Ayurvedic students, who now are very well equipped
to read Madhava's treatise on Etiology (c. 700 AD).
Whoever wants to build a small personal library of
Ayurvedic books should FIRST acquire G. Jan Meulen-
beld, The Madhavanidana and its Chief Commentary,
Chapters 1-10, Introd., transl. and notes, Leiden:
Brill, 1974, which is exhaustive on the ten first
chapters, and also offers a key to hundreds of
technical words and proper names. Then, another
English translation, which is complete in one volume
and is also quite good, was recently published by
Professor K.R. Srikanta Murthy, Madhava Nidana,
Text with English transl., Critical Introd. and
Neither Singhal's nor Murthy's work can compete
with the unparalleled scholarship and philological
accuracy of Professor Meulembeld. Nevertheless,
their translations are more readable, and more
practical. Singhal and his associates do not call
their work a "translation," but a "medical inter-
pretation." Sometimes, they help us to see the
point, when some technical detail of Ayurvedic
practice is blurred in Meulembeld's rendering. For
example, in Chapter 3 (Oilarrhoea), śokaka 2a:
sneādhyair... Meulembeld (p. 194) "by oleagi-
nous substances, etc." is not clear; one might even
say that the word "substances" here is a mistake;
sneha designates an operation, not a substance.
Murthy rightly says (p. 16): "[by] therapies like
oleation, etc.", and Singhal (p. 67) inserts a gloss
going in the same direction: "[by] (pāncakarma...
thepathies like) oleation, etc." Meulembeld could
argue that in translating the Commentary (p. 195)
he adduced a justification for his translation:
sneha is both potions ("drinking of a sneha") and
oil-baths, oily enemas, i.e., operations. However,
Murthy's and Singhal's use of the word "oleation"
is much more accurate than Meulembeld's "oleaginous
substances," since what is meant in this passage is
the first operation in the series of operations
that constitute a pāncakarma course of treatment.
Potions (of ghee) are included in "oleation." The
emphasis is on the technique, the manipulation,
the operation, the therapeutic action, not at all on
the greasy or oleaginous quality of substances.
Being more practical, Murthy and Singhal are more
accurate in particular instances of that kind.

Madhavanidana

G.D. SINGHAL, S.M. TRIPATHI, K.R. SHARMA
Ayurvedic Clinical Diagnosis, Part I
Based on Chapters 1-32 of the
Madhava-Nidana
Sanskrit Text, English & Hindi Translation,
and Notes 1xviii—558 pp.
Varanasi: Singhal Publications, 1985
Andrew Learmonth

Andrew LEARMONTH
Disease Ecology,
An Introduction
0-631-15799-9 (paperback)

Published for the first time in 1958 by Professor Learmonth, and reprinted several times since then, this map (found in this book, p. 323) represents an impressive achievement in the medical geographer's approaches to regional synthesis. It was based on Learmonth's life-long studies of South Asian geography, and on intuitive integration of a series of more specialized maps projecting onto the territory of India, district by district, infant mortality rates, Cholera incidence rates, etc. Reprinted again in the present book, it teaches us an important methodological lesson.

Primary Health Care

Kris HEGGENHOGEN with Paola SESIA-LEWIS
Traditional Medicine and Primary Health Care
An Introduction and Selected Annotated Bibliography

EPC Publication No 18, Autumn 1988, £5 postage included
ISSN 0267-5994 74 pp. Available from:
Evaluation and Planning Centre for Health Care
London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine
Keppel Street, London WC1E 7HT, U.K.

The Evaluation and Planning Centre (EPC) is a multi-disciplinary group concerned with health policy, planning, management and evaluation issues in developing countries. EPC is an independent research unit within the Division of Community Health at the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine. The staff hold academic teaching and research posts recognized by the University of London.

The publication divides the domain it covers into eight subsections: Defining traditional medicine; Traditional birth attendants; The efficacy of traditional medicine; Collaboration and cooption; National policies on traditional medicine; Traditional medical associations; Educational implications.

In the Introduction the point is made that traditional medicine must be taken into account when planning primary health care programmes, if no other reason than because it is used by a significant number of people throughout the world either as the only health resource available or as a substitute for, or complement to, allopathic services.

Of particular interest is the discussion of Efficacy (pp. 8-13): pharmacological, or psychological, or social efficacy. This section is followed by a two-page paragraph (pp. 13-15) offered, as it were, as a transition from the question of Efficacy to the question of Co-operation. It is entitled: "Others and Ourselves: Viewing orthodox medicine from a traditional perspective." Promoting PHC, the authors argue, implies "a critical self-examination... Similarly, the understanding of, and contact with, traditional medicine may, in juxtaposition, enable us to be constructively critical of the prevailing health services model which has been challenged as only a partial, or as a truncated, health care system."

The bibliographic annotations are very useful, because they are selective, insightful and of a perfect clarity of style. The classics are brought back to our attention, including Clark Cunningham's paper on Thai "injection doctors" which was published twenty years ago (in Soc. Sc. & Med. 4, 1970, 1-24).
Professor Andrew A.T. Learmonth is known to the academic world for his distinguished publications on South Asia and medical geography. In 1965, he joined O.H.K. Spate's project and together they brought out the third edition of India and Pakistan, A General and Regional Geography, London, Methuen, 1967, a monument (constantly reprinted). He has also published extensively on the medical geography of South Asia (see IASTAM Newsletter no. 11, Sept. 1988, p. 10). His new book, Disease Ecology, flows from almost forty years of commitment to this field of studies. It is less an introduction (although the style is very clear and pedagogical) than a treatise composed by a master of the craft, and a reference book, the value of which is enhanced by a sixty-page bibliography, an index of authors, and an extremely elaborate index of subjects.

The author's aim "has been to provide at least entry points into the literature across a broad spectrum, for students of geography and perhaps other social sciences too. Entry points have not specifically been provided on the philosophy and epistemology of disease ecology or medical geography, though readers interested in these important themes will find at least some in works cited for reasons other (p. XI)."

Pathogens are defined, and map interpretation discussed, in the introduction.

PART I, "Western Diseases?" (with a question mark), begins with a discussion of universals in pathology ("Universal's and 'Western' Diseases?". It includes: Health in industrial and post-industrial countries; Mapping cancer; Further cartographic studies; The idea of "Surfaces"; The spatial diffusion of disease; Disease patterns; Historical geography of disease.

PART II, "The Third World," includes: Jacques May's classification and 'tropical' diseases; Malaria and other mosquito-borne diseases; Schistosomiasis; Onchocerciasis or river blindness; Some third world cancers; Is there a geography of hunger?

Each chapter is made of a number of tableaux depicting local conditions with a wealth of maps and figures. At the same time, an attempt is made at drawing macro-scale boundaries or watersheds, "belts" or "disease continents," e.g., "the meningitis belt," or "a model of a hypothetical malarial continent."

PART III, "Towards Synthesis," includes: Approaches to regional synthesis; The geography of public health (with a few remarks on the integration of traditional medicine in primary health care). A few pages devoted to India, at the beginning of Part III, represent a convenient and convincing epitome of Learmonth's life-long familiarity with South Asia. Successively: A West Bengal village in 1950 (p. 315 ss.), The Meso-scale: Chandigarh Dun (316 ss.), The Macro-scale: Late Colonial India (320 ss.).

D. N. Kakar

D. N. KAKAR
Primary Health Care and Traditional Medical Practitioners,
New Delhi:
195 pp. Rs. 125 ISBN 81 207 0853 9

This study highlights the positive and negative aspects of the role of traditional medical practitioners in a community development block of rural Haryana (North India). Dr. Kakar has attempted to evaluate to which extent their patients - nearly three-fourths of the population (p. 2) - benefited from their therapeutic help.

During the summer of 1976, he undertook a study of local beliefs about the etiology, diagnosis and therapy of a selection of childhood diseases, he interviewed 198 female respondents, that is, representatives of practically every household in the village (p. 7). This first approach was developed by other surveys and interviews of different groups of people in neighboring villages of the same block in later years. Information was also gathered from 64 traditional medical practitioners who practiced in the block, on their socio-economic background, their clientele, the type of diseases they dealt with, the type of therapies and drugs they administered. Only nine of them had earned a regular degree (in Ayurveda); in addition to them the block had some 600 folk practitioners of all kinds (p. 30). Dr. Kakar provides us with rich information and relevant discussions on the patients' choice of therapy, the consumption of drugs, the social context of quackery. An interesting and promising aspect of researches reported in this book is the fact that they have been conceived as a continuous process since 1976. In focusing on one and the same local setting (here, the neighboring villages in one and the same community development block), the collection of data is cumulative and the analysis can go further in depth, estimates also can be improved and made more accurate on the basis of "re-checks" (see p. 112 for a convincing example).

Professor D. N. KAKAR, Ph.D., M.P.H., is Acting Head of the Department of Community Medicine, Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh 160012, India

ALAN ROLAND continued from page nine

PART TWO, "The Indian and Japanese Self: Theoretical Perspectives," includes: The Indian familial self in its social and cultural contexts; The Indian and Japanese familial self; The spiritual self: continuity and counterpoint to the familial self.

Conclusions: Psychoanalysis in civilizational perspective.
femininity continued from page two
of so-called indigenous "explanatory paradigms" of disease (p. 113). Eliciting from patients and healers their Explanatory Models is a method invented and practiced by the Harvard school of medical anthropology. Indeed, you can arrange EMs in classes such as "evil eye, magic, and possession - the three most common sources of illness and misfortune" (p.113) among the Awlad 'Alli. But in so doing, you remain at the surface of things. The description is more insightful when, beneath the conventional scenario of demonic possession, for example, you are able to point to the emotion that is at the root of disease: "Serious illnesses are usually caused by solitary encounters in deserted places with jinn (spirits)... The experience of such encounters is always described in terms of fear. Fright also causes other illnesses, such as hepatitis, whose symptoms of yellowness are believed to be caused by the rise of bile accompanying a frightened gasp" (p.115). Abu-Lughod invokes also (p. 197) fright as an explanation substituted by the girl's family for the physician's diagnosis, in a certain case of death by cancer. If fear is so ubiquitous in discourses about illness, it is much more than a more explanatory model, it is a basic tenet in Awlad 'Ali culture. One regrets that "fear" or "fright" was omitted from the (otherwise excellent) index, as also was omitted the theme of "excessive worry," that is, emotions which destroy 'agl (wisdom, maturity, self-control). The Bedouins think of 'agl as "profundely connected to thoughts and memories and, ultimately, to worries. Many poems warn of the dangers of excessive worry and thought. Thinking and remembering are often linked in poetry to assorted maladies..." (p. 270). Simultaneously, 'agl is conceived of as based in the heart, and negative emotions like fear or despair "fill the heart" (p. 204, il-'agl... with both anguish and physical suffering, both brooding and insomnia. Maybe the author did not emphasize enough the physical nature of emotions. Maybe what she calls "illnesses" (to comply with the dominant paradigm in American anthropology) should have been simply called "diseases."

But these are pedestrian remarks on a truly marvellous book, beautifully and modestly written.

BOMBAY 1990

cine (Phillip Zarrilli), Ethnosemiotics of medical interpretation (Gilles Bibeau), Explanation and decision-making in South Asian medicine (Charles Nuckolls), Acculturation and domination in Asian medical systems (Dorothea Sich), Traditional medicine and Primary Health Care (Iris Kapil; Kris Heggenhoven; Ivan Wolffers). Etc., etc.